

**H2020-ICT-688712**



Project: H2020-ICT-688712

Project Name:

5G Applications and Devices Benchmarking (TRIANGLE)

## Deliverable D1.5

### Year 3 Periodic Report and final report, public summary

Date of delivery:	04/06/2019	Version:	2.0
Start date of Project:	01/01/2016	Duration:	36 months



## Deliverable D1.5

# Year 3 Periodic Report and final report, public summary

<b>Project Number:</b>	ICT-688712
<b>Project Name:</b>	5G Applications and Devices Benchmarking
<b>Project Acronym</b>	TRIANGLE

<b>Document Number:</b>	ICT-688712-TRIANGLE/D1.5
<b>Document Title:</b>	Year 3 Periodic Report and final report, public summary
<b>Lead beneficiary:</b>	Keysight Technologies Belgium
<b>Editor(s):</b>	Keysight Technologies Belgium
<b>Authors:</b>	Keysight Technologies Belgium (Michael Dieudonné), Keysight Technologies Denmark (Hua Wang, Marek Rohr, German Corrales Madueño), Universidad de Malaga (Almudena Díaz, Bruno García), DEKRA Testing and Certification S.A.U (Carlos Cárdenas, Janie Baños, Oscar Castañeda, Juan Carlos Mora, Pablo Romero), Quamotion (Frederik Carlier, Bart Saint Germain), UCL (Niall roche), REDZ (Donal Moris, Jeanne Caffrey)
<b>Dissemination Level:</b>	PU
<b>Contractual Date of Delivery:</b>	31/12/2018 + 60 days
<b>Work Package Leader:</b>	KEYB
<b>Status:</b>	Final
<b>Version:</b>	2.0
<b>File Name:</b>	TRIANGLE_Deliverable_D1.5_FINAL

### Abstract

This deliverable contains a public summary of the project final report.

### Keywords

TRIANGLE, final report, public summary.



**Document:** ICT-688712-TRIANGLE/D1.5

**Date:** 05/06/2019

**Dissemination:** PU

**Status:** Final

**Version:** 2.0

---

## Document history

V1.0	Initial Release of the document
V2.0	Adaptation of the public summary to be less technical and focus more on what it means for the European citizens as per request at the project final review from the expert panel



## Executive summary

Mobile applications and new services will be a dominant element in the 5G domain. Ensuring the correct and efficient behaviour of the applications, services and devices on which they run becomes a critical factor to ensure the mobile communications market meets the expectations of final users.

Starting from a 4G perspective, the key differences for 5G will be higher throughput (more and faster data), low latency (having less time to wait for the requested data, up to the point where end user could have immediate actuated response) and high reliability (having a certitude that your data will be transferred properly).

5G will be built on these new technical capabilities to innovate around what services can be delivered to the end user, the consumer or a business (vertical). When speaking services, we need to find a good metric to measure in how far the delivered service match the expectations. Here the agreed metric is the Quality of Experience or QoE.

QoE is not a new metric, it is measured by human (panels) who consumes a service and rate how well it performed. The QoE as a human based measurement is heavily influenced by many factors such as the conditions in which the person consume the service, the ambient noise or light, the quality of the data connection etc... Certain aspects of the QoE estimation can be controlled by a telecom operator offering 5G services (data speed or data rate as an example) while others (e.g. sunlight) can't obviously be influenced by a telecom operator. Based on this observation, we can artificially separate/partition all factors influencing the QoE into 2 independent sets:

- factors which are independent of the telecom operator (sunlight, user mood)
- factors that are under control of the telecom operator (connection quality)

Having defined these 2 partitions, we can state that the QoE is function of the 2 independent influences. If the service would be consumed in a perfect environment for the end user, the QoE would only be impacted by the factors that are under control from the operator side. We name that perfect external condition measured QoE the synthetic QoE.

Synthetic QoE enable app developer, telecom operator and device maker estimate how the service will be received by the end user independently of any externa non-controlled factor. It is a help in the evolving 5G sector to estimate what the effective QoE will be given a set of controlled configurations. We called the Synthetic QoE the TRIANGLE mark.

The EU project TRIANGLE, has built a framework which in an automatic way measure and estimate the synthetic QoE. together with the framework, the consortium developed domains, test cases, and scenarios. All of these are then aggregated in function of the relevance into the Synthetic QoE.

For the European citizen, this capability will be very important to embrace 5G fully working services. This technology will impact the quality of any type of 5G services towards citizens, smart cities, IoT systems... The direct impact for the citizens are better 5G services, more efficient and fulfilling their promises against all controllable telecom parameters.



---

**Document:** ICT-688712-TRIANGLE/D1.5

**Date:** 05/06/2019

**Dissemination:** PU

**Status:** Final

**Version:** 2.0

---

The project started in January 2016 and lasted for 36 months (3 years). The project delivered a functional testbed in its first year and did continuous improvement for the remaining of the project. Over the year, more functionality, more test cases & more test scenarios were added. At the same time, potential customers have been exploiting the available features and provided feedback on potential improvements and missing features.

An important part of the work in TRIANGLE, aside developing the vision and the testbed, was to attract users to validate the concept. Over the complete project duration, 42 companies and universities applied to use the testbed to run experiments and 13 applied for extensions. The test approach has been so interesting and valuable that some of the applicants not selected in the Open Call have requested access to the testbed services without funding. Open Call 5 reused this non-funded approach to ensure applicants were truly interested in the testbed and not just receiving funding. Towards the end of the project, an extra open call 6 (OC6) was launched to attract further users with low amount of funding but with a high 5G content.

One of the challenges encountered by TRIANGLE during the project was to find advanced users truly needing true 5G capabilities and test during the project. Yes, a lot of companies and universities claim 5G applications, but the reality shows that quite some of them can partially run on a 4G network. For advanced SMEs, given the fact that 5G is still 'far away', or in other words more than 2 years out, it was a challenge to find devices and true 5G applications amongst them. Here a clear signal was received that one of the first key use case for SME will be to work around IoT devices. For this reason, the consortium implemented the NB-IoT capability in the testbed and developed the associated test cases and metrics. This IoT capability did attract quite some users to the testbed.

The concept around synthetic QoE evaluated with an End-to-End testing approach also gained traction within the industry.

The project vision of E2E benchmarking and QoE automatic assessment has also gained traction from within the community. The approach was presented at the Mobile World Congress 2017 and Mobile World Congress 2018. In January 2018, NGMN published a position paper "DEFINITION OF THE TESTING FRAMEWORK FOR THE NGMN 5G PRE-COMMERCIAL NETWORKS TRIALS", which endorses the TRIANGLE approach, the TRIANGLE service definitions, and KPI for E2E QoE measurements (NGMN, 2018). The concept and approach were also presented different occasions in leading industrial bodies such as the Global Certification forum (GCF) and the International Wireless Industry Consortium (IWPC).

On the technical side, 4 testbed releases were created expanding capabilities and tests libraries. Clear feedback was received by users about the simplicity of the usability and the testing. This was one of the core values of the project to ensure low maintenance long term cost and ensure potential profitability in a commercial context. We are now at the end of the early R&D phase and prepare for commercial services in line with our planned exploitation plan. Aside the commercial aspects, some key learnings from the project will also be transferred to the other 5G EU programs (ICT17 and ICT19) around service expectations, test cases, KPI measurement and service validation.



**Issued Deliverables in Period 3**

Deliverable Number	Deliverable Title	WP number	Lead beneficiary	Type	Summary Description
D1.5	Year 3 Periodic Report and final report, public summary	WP1	KEYB	Report	Public summary of the P3 report
D1.8	Year 3 Periodic Report and final report	WP1	KEYB	Report	This document, full P3 management report.
D2.5	Report on 5G evolution Y3	WP2	DEKRA	Report	5G evolution and how it influences TRIANGLE
D2.6	Final test scenario & test specifications	WP2	DEKRA	Other	Final version of all test scenarios developed in TRIANGLE
D2.7	Triangle QoE approach	WP2	DEKRA	Report	Full description of the QoE framework
D3.2 V1.1	Implementation report on the testing framework Rel 2 and specification of Rel 3.	WP3	UMA	Report	Updated based on P2 review
D3.4	Implementation report on the testing framework Rel 3 and specification of Rel 4	WP3	UMA	Report	Testbed release definitions and implementation report
D3.5	Implementation report on the testing framework Rel 4	WP3	UMA	Report	Testbed final implementation report for all releases together
D3.6	Triangle testbed calibration and baseline	WP3	KEYD	Report	Covers how the TRIANGLE mark is achieved and the testbed calibration requirements
D4.3	Report on the QoS management at the application level	WP4	KEYD	Report	Explains how the QoS is controlled at the application level
D5.4	Results of Second Open Call	WP5	UCL	Report	Learning from the 2nd open call.
D5.5	Results of Third Open Call	WP5	UCL	Report	Learning from the 3rd open call.
D5.6	Final Report on Results and Insights from TRIANGLE Testbed Experimenters	WP5	UCL	Report	Reporting on all experiments (confidential and non confidential)
D5.7	TRIANGLE Experiments and Extensions	WP5	UCL	Report	1 pager set to be used for the EC promotion of FIRE
D5.8	Recommended TRIANGLE marks for certification of service	WP5	UCL	Report	Certification process
D6.4	Project metrics and collection of Triangle Technical Publications	WP6	REDZ	Report	Project metrics evaluation and dissemination



**Reached Milestones in Period 3**

Milestone number	Milestone title	WP number	Lead beneficiary	Due date (in months)	Means of verification	Status
MS5	Final review	WP1	1 - KEYB	36	This review	Pending approval
MS21	Completion of the test framework based on experimenter feedback	WP2	6 - AT4	33	This milestone ensures the formalization of the complete set of test cases identified in the WP2 and reported in D3.5.	Achieved on time
MS12	Third version of the testing framework	WP3	3 - UMA	27	This milestone ensures that the final version of the framework has been released incorporating all the developments carried out in WP3 and WP4.	Achieved on time
MS14	QoS management at the application level ready	WP4	2 - KEYD	30	This milestone ensures that QoS configuration mechanisms have been implemented and are ready for experimentation.	Achieved on time
MS16	Results of the 2nd Open Call	WP5	5 - UCL	27	Experiments of the 2nd Open call completed. Lessons learned and results obtained will be collected and analysed.	Achieved on time
MS17	Results of the 3rd Open Call	WP5	5 - UCL	33	Experiments of the 3rd Open call completed. Lessons learned and results obtained are collected and analyzed in D5.4	Achieved on time
MS20	Final Collection of Technical Publications Available	WP6	4 - REDZ6	36	Collection of the technical papers and communications published to promote the results and outcomes of the project.	Achieved on time